



# UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE  
United States Patent and Trademark Office  
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS  
P.O. Box 1450  
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450  
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
09/977,666	10/15/2001	J. Yong Ryu	CDT 1792	3465
1338	7590	08/24/2004	EXAMINER	
KENNETH H. JOHNSON P.O. BOX 630708 HOUSTON, TX 772630000			NGUYEN, CAM N	
			ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER
			1754	

DATE MAILED: 08/24/2004

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

Art Unit: 1754

***Response to Reply Brief***

1. Applicants' reply brief/remarks filed on June 07, 2004 is noted. Applicants' arguments have been carefully reconsidered, but they were not found persuasive for the same reasons as set forth in the Examiner's Answer.

Furthermore, it is considered the Examiner did not mistakenly randomly selected bits and pieces from different portions of the same reference as parts list to recreate the present claimed invention as argued by Applicants. The combination of the metals selected from the 10<sup>th</sup> group and 11<sup>th</sup> group metals, and the promoters disclosed by Frenzel is considered a small list of elements and it falls within the list of 14 combinations of Applicants'. Thus, the claims are met by the reference.

With respect to Applicants' argument (3), the Examiner does not understand why claim 8 should be withdrawn? Same thing with claim 12? There was an obviousness rejection made to claim 8 presented in the Final rejection and it was also addressed in the Examiner's Answer.

2. Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Examiner Cam Nguyen, whose telephone number is (571) 272-1357. The examiner can normally be reached on M-F from 9:30 am. to 6:00 pm.

The appropriate fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is (703) 872-9306.

Any inquiry of a general nature or relating to the status of this application or proceeding should be directed to telephone number (571) 272-1700.

Nguyen/cnn *cnn*

*Cam Nguyen*  
CAM N. NGUYEN  
PRIMARY EXAMINER

August 23, 2004

Art Unit: 1754